Shakespeare's

Indiana University Press

BLOOMINGTON AND INDIANAPOLIS



Christian Dimension

ANTHOLOGY OF COMMENTARY

EDITED BY

Roy Battenhouse



PREFACE

ommentary on Christian dimensions in Shakespeare has been accumulating over the years. Beginning in the nineteenth century with a noticing of his biblical allusions and of passages reminiscent of Bible themes, it has deepened to include attention to his echoings of liturgical language and theological concepts. Increasingly, the relation of his plays to medieval mystery and morality drama has been probed and illustrated, and also his indebtedness to the worldviews of Augustine, Boethius, Aquinas, Dante, and Erasmus. Observations on these matters, along with interpretations of Shakespeare's works in the light of Christian lore, have been substantive enough to warrant now a scholarly overview for public attention. A bringing together of pertinent excerpts from the commentary of the last fifty years can provide, especially if the selections are read in conjunction with each other, an impressive challenge to reappreciate the Christian roots of Shakespeare's art.

The present anthology reprints ninety-two pieces of commentary on twenty-six of the plays. In addition, it provides a supplementary bibliography of more than two hundred fifty further items. These features taken together make it a useful research manual, especially if readers consult its Index. Yet it is not exhaustive in its coverage; it is simply a sifting out of what seems to me chiefly valuable. My guiding purpose has been to provide both for scholars and for the general reader a reliable sampling of the influence of Shakespeare's Christian heritage on the shaping of his plays.

The collection can be a timely resource for today's college teachers, I believe, since it focuses attention on a perspective quite different from various of the modern ones nowadays widely used—for instance, the "cultural materialism" which proceeds to question whether Shakespeare's art is "for all time" as Ben Jonson supposed. Our students, I think, deserve the option of an alternative to such an approach. Let the present volume serve this classroom need, so that informed debate may be possible.

bate may be possible.

My title "Christian Dimension" is intended to indicate that more than local color is involved when Shakespeare puts biblical allusions or echoes into the speech of persons in his plays. Such references point us often to paradigms by which the action can be evaluated. For even when a speaker misapplies Scripture, his distortion exposes a blind spot in his character. A biblical norm, so to speak, puts him under judgment. Drama has, underneath its value of entertainment, a logic of design that gives it a core of parable—so Sidney insisted in his Elizabethan defense of poetry. Thus the reader is challenged to be a secker of wisdom such as Ecclesiasticus 39 describes: "He will be conversant with dark parables" and "travel through

xii Preface

strange countries." Jesus used parables to challenge in auditors their capacity to distinguish between good and evil. May not Shakespeare's stories have a similar purpose, evident in the shape they give to the paths of human felicity or folly?

A well known New Testament parable tells of a sower whose seed produced a

A well known New Testament parable tells of a sower whose seed produced a proper harvest only when it met with good soil. Shakespeare undoubtedly knew this parable, and it is likely that he understood its four kinds of soil as representing the diverse kinds of listener response his own plays would receive. In any case the response of auditors over the centuries, both to the Bible and to Shakespeare, has varied in accord with each reader's capacities of heart and mind. Often the capacity has been shallow. But a kind of good-soil responsiveness to the seminal potential of Shakespeare's artwork seems to me evident in the commentaries the present anthology contains. At least their attention to biblical themes and patterns, it can be said, offers us eyes for seeing and ears for hearing dimensions of meaning which usually go unrecognized by other schools of criticism. Patrick Murray could remark in his The Shakespearian Scene (1969) that "the volume of distinctly Christian ideas, implied or expressed in Shakespeare's work as a whole, has not yet received anything like its due share of attention." Toward remedying this situation I have prepared the present book.

prepared the present book.

I am indebted and grateful to many publishers and authors for their permissions to reprint the excerpts here assembled. All the essays have been abridged, and many of their footnotes (sometimes all) have been eliminated. I have had to prune severely in order to present essential insights from a large array of commentators. Their fuller texts should be looked into by painstaking readers. I have not tried to standardize the line references to Shakespeare, which here are always those of each essayist to his chosen text.

Finally, let me record that I have received invaluable help from my wife Marian and from my daughter Anna and her husband John Kolts, to each of whom I feel a deep gratitude.

Roy Battenhouse Bloomington, Indiana

CONTENTS

Preface • xi

Introduction: An Overview of Christian Interpretation • 1

PART I SOME KEY ASSESSMENTS

Comment and bibliography • 17

ROBERT SPEAIGHT Christianity in Shakespeare • 21

J. A. BRYANT, JR. Typology in Shakespeare • 23

L. A. CORMICAN Medieval Idiom in Shakespeare • 24

NEVILL COGHILL The Basis of Shakespearian Comedy • 27

GLYNNE WICKHAM Shakespeare's "Small Latine and Less Greeke" • FRANCIS FERGUSSON Dante and Shakespeare • 34

TOM F. DRIVER Shakespeare's Sense of History • 36

M. D. H. PARKER Nature and Grace in The Romances • 40

ROY BATTENHOUSE Shakespeare's Augustinian Artistry • 44

The Christian Basis of Sonnet 146 • 50

PART II ON SHAKESPEARE'S COMEDIES

Introduction • 57

The Comedy of Errors Comment and bibliography • 58 R. CHRIS HASSEL, JR. The Liturgical Context of Errors • 59 GLYN AUSTEN Redemption in *The Comedy of Errors* • 61

The Merchant of Venice Comment and bibliography • 68 J. A. BRYANT, JR. Bassanio's Two Saviors • 71

BARBARA K. LEWALSKI Allegory in *The Merchant of Venice* • 76

JOHN R. COOPER Shylock's Humanity • 83

JOAN OZARK HOLMER Shylock and the Leaden Casket • 85

LAWRENCE DANSON Shylock's Trial • 87

AUSTIN DOBBINS & ROY BATTENHOUSE Jessica's Exodus • 93 MARK GNERRO Easter Liturgy and Love Duet in MV 5.1 • 100

Much Ado About Nothing Comment and bibliography • 103 ARTHUR C. KIRSCH Impediments and Remedy in Much Ado • 105

As You Like It Comment and bibliography • 112 AS 101 LIKE IF Comment and oronography

ALICE-LYLE SCOUFOS The Testing of Love in As You Like It • 114

WILLIAM WATTERSON As You Like It as Christian Pastoral • 117

RENÉ E. FORTIN "Tongues in Trees" in As You Like It • 122

Twelfth Night Comment and bibliography • 127

BARBARA K. LEWALSKI Thematic Patterns in Twelfth Night • 130

RENÉ E. FORTIN Twelfth Night: Drama of Initiation • 137

All's Well That Ends Well Comment and bibliography E. M. W. TILLYARD Theological Tone in All's Well • 145

ERIC LAGUARDIA Nature Redeemed in All's Well • 147

ROBERT GRAMS HUNTER Christian Theme in All's Well • 150

FRANCES PEARCE The Way of Redemption in All's Well • 154

JOHN D. COX Helena's Humility • 157

PEGGY MUÑOZ SIMONDS Bertram and the Marriage Duty • 160

Measure for Measure Comment and bibliography • 163 G. WILSON KNIGHT Measure for Measure and the Gospels • 167

ROYBATTENHOUSE Measure for Measure and the Gospels • 17

ROYBATTENHOUSE Measure for Measure and the Gospels • 181

ARTHUR C. KIRSCH The Integrity of Measure for Measure • 181

DIANE MCCOLLEY "Physic Bitter to Sweet End" • 188

Pericles Comment and bibliography • 194 Fertices Comment and orbitography • 194

F. D. HOENIGER Pericles and the Miracle Play • 197

HOWARD FEIPERIN This Great Miracle • 198

CYNTHIA MARSHALL Pericles and the Cosmic Overview • 202

MAURICE HUNT Pericles and Jonah • 208

Cymbeline Comment and bibliography • 216 HOMER D. SWANDER Cymbeline: Religious Idea and Dramatic Design • 219
DAVID SCOTT KASTAN The Strange Truth of Cymbeline • 224
ARTHUR C. KIRSCH Atonement After Fortunate Fall • 226 PEGGY MUÑOZ SIMONDS The Renewed Eagle • 228

The Winter's Tale Comment and bibliography • 232 S. L. BETHELL Sin, Repentance, and Restoration • 236

DARYLL GRANTLEY The Winter's Tale and Early Religious Drama • 239

JOHN D. COX Medieval Precedent in The Winter's Tale • 245

FRANÇOIS LAROQUE Christian Liturgy and The Winter's Tale • 247

Contents

The Tempest Comment and bibliography • 250 GEORGE SLOVER An Analogical Reading of *The Tempest* • 254

GEORGE SLOVER An Analogical Reading of *The Tempest* • 257

ROBERT GRAMS HUNTER The Regeneration of Alonso • 263

PATRICK GRANT *The Tempest* and the Magic of Charity • 267

JAMES WALTER From Tempest to Epilogue • 271

PART III ON SHAKESPEARE'S HISTORIES

Introduction • 283

Richard II Comment and bibliography • 287 HERBERT R. COURSEN Hollow Rituals in Richard II • 289

Henry IV, Parts 1, 2 Comment and bibliography . 298 D. A. TRAVERSI Falstaff's Functions • 301 ROY BATTENHOUSE Falstaff as Parodist • 303

> Henry V Comment and bibliography . 315 HAROLD C. GODDARD Henry V . 318

Henry VI, Parts 1,2,3 Comment and bibliography • 327

JONATHAN CLARK SMITH The Denial of the Shepherd • 329

WILLIAM WATTERSON Parodic Shepherding in Henry VI • 331

EMRYS JONES Passion-Play Echoes in Henry VI • 333 JOHN R. ELLIOTT, JR. The History Play as Drama • 336

Richard III Comment and bibliography • 338 EMRYS JONES Bosworth, All Souls, and Constantine • 341
TOM F. DRIVER Nemesis and Judgment in Richard III • 345
SCOTT COLLEY Richard III and Herod • 350 PHYLLIS RACKIN Providential Design in Richard III • 355

PART IV ON SHAKESPEARE'S TRAGEDIES

Introduction • 359

Romeo and Juliet Comment and bibliography • 363 W. H. AUDEN The Tragedy of *Romeo and Juliet* • 366 FRANCIS FERGUSSON Romantic Love as Lost • 367 JOHN F. ANDREWS Falling in Love: The Tragedy of Romeo and Juliet • 370

Contents

Hamlet Comment and bibliography • 382 ELEANOR PROSSER Spirit of Health or Goblin Damned? • 386 CHERREL GUILFOYLE The Beginning of Hamlet • 391
ROY BATTENHOUSE Hamlet's Evasions and Inversions • 395 JAMES BLACK Hamlet's Vows • 406

D. W. ROBERTSON A Medievalist Looks at Hamlet • 410

Othello Comment and bibliography • 415 DAVID JEFREY & PATRICK GRANT Reputation in Othello • 418

ROY BATTENHOUSE Othello as a Judas • 423

JOAN OZARK HOLMER The "Base Judean" • 427

Troilus and Cressida Comment and bibliography • 430 DAVID KAULA "Mad Idolatry" in *Troilus and Cressida* • 433
MAURICE HUNT *Troilus and Cressida* and Christian Irony • 439

King Lear Comment and bibliography • 444 King Lear Comment and bibliography • 444

PETER MILWARD The Religious Dimension of King Lear • 448

ROGER L. COX King Lear and the Corinthian Letters • 453

MAYNARD MACK Archetype and Parable in King Lear • 460

WALTER STEIN The Extreme Verge in King Lear • 460

JOSEPH WITTREICH "As it was played ... St Stephan's night" • 470

Macbeth Comment and bibliography • 473 ROLAND MUSHAT FRYE Macbeth and the Powers of Darkness • 477 PAUL JORGENSEN Macbeth's Soliloquy • 481

GLYNNE WICKHAM Macbeth and Mediaeval Stage Plays • 485

ROY WALKER Scotland's Christian Geography • 489

HARRY MORRIS Hell and Judgment in Macbeth • 491

Antony and Cleopatra Comment and bibliography • 494 CLIFFORD DAVIDSON Shakespeare's Archetypal Cleopatra • 497
ANDREW FICHTER Antony and Cleopatra and Christian Quest • 499
DAVID SCOTT KASTAN The Ending of Antony and Cleopatra • 504